



PRESBYTERY OF NEW COVENANT

PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH (U.S.A.)

Growing congregations that passionately engage their community to make disciples.

November 2007

Mike Cole
General Presbyter

Wendy Bailey
Mary Marcotte
*Associate General
Presbyters*

Diane Prevary
Stated Clerk

Sharon Darden
*Coordinator for
Committee on Ministry
and Committee for
Preparations*

H. Richard Siciliano
Robert Ferguson
Executive Emerti

Jack H. Boelens
T. Stewart Coffman
General Presbyter Emerti

Dear Friends in Christ,

As a member of the Care of Church Professionals Subcommittee of Committee on Ministry I volunteered to work on developing some guidelines for the annual evaluation of church professionals. Through Sharon Darden I sent an email that asked the churches in our presbytery to answer a few questions regarding their best practices regarding their annual evaluations. We received responses from over 30 churches and from what we received we have adopted guidelines for such reviews and share them with you through this email.

Included in the guidelines are some sample questions gleaned from the responses we received and an adaptation of the forms from the Church Leadership Connection from the PC(USA) website.

We would appreciate any feedback you would have on these guidelines.

Rev. Jim Gill, D. Min
Organizing Pastor Peace Presbyterian Church
Pearland, Texas

Presbytery of New Covenant Care of Church Professionals Committee
Guidelines for Church Professional Evaluations
November 5, 2007

Among its many responsibilities, the Session of each local congregation is tasked to provide for the annual review of its personnel (G-10.102n). This includes an annual review of the pastor/s and a review regarding the adequacy of the compensation for the pastor/s (G-7.0203a). This task may be completed by the session acting as a committee of the whole; or, the responsibility may be charged to a personnel committee or Ministry Team that will report its work to the session. Our Committee is grateful for the responses to our email questionnaire and based on the responses we offer the following to our committee for consideration.

One response put the evaluation process for the pastor/s in perspective with these words, "Good evaluations start with good job descriptions and goals. Pastors/Staff start out with job descriptions when they are hired, but these need to be updated each year, as necessary, in the evaluation process. There also need to be goals established to guide the pastor(s) /staff person so that the most important things can get the highest priority of his/her time and effort, and these change over time and need to be updated in the evaluation process also.

The evaluation process needs to be non-adversarial. We are out to help the pastor(s) / staff person succeed, not to blame him/her for the problems in the church. It needs to be an open forum where all issues can be put on the table.

Adequacy of Compensation

Each year the session of the church is required to review the adequacy of compensation for the pastor. This review is to take into consideration the realistic cost of living for any given community.

The Purpose of Evaluation

The purpose of a performance evaluation is not to survey the congregation for its opinions and feelings. No church is unanimous in its support for or dislike of any staff member or pastor. In every church there is a diversity of opinion which reflects the diversity of expectations of each member of the congregation. The purposes of a performance evaluation (for a staff member or pastor) are:

1. to establish dialogue between the employee, supervisor and a committee;
2. to serve the work-related need for feedback for both the supervisor and employees;
3. to demonstrate accountability of supervisor to employee and vice versa;
4. to build trust and teamwork;
5. to properly recognize contributions of each member of the church staff;
6. to provide a written record of work;
7. to provide an opportunity to learn goals/ambitions/issues/expectations that were not previously articulated.

The review discussion may involve clarifying expectations, review of work progress and constructive feedback. Within the context of a personnel review, all feedback should be

1. descriptive (describe the behavior and not the person, and remain nonjudgmental in time)
2. specific (focused on a specific action or event that is identifiable and not based on hearsay, and avoids a generalization or meaningless expressions)
3. directed toward behavior the employee can change,
4. is encouraged rather than imposed, and
5. uses feedback techniques to confirm that the message was understood.

To be successful, the employee must understand:

1. how she/he is doing in her/his work;
2. what needs to be changed, improved and maintained;
3. opportunities that exist to help improvement;
4. what will be used to measure and evaluate future work performance.

Use of Evaluation Tools

If you choose to use forms as part of your review, they should:

1. be given to a limited number of persons; limiting circulation to those who work closely with the pastor or employee. It is rarely beneficial to survey the entire congregation in personnel matters.
2. be signed by the person filling them out. The forms can be collated and summarized and presented to the person being reviewed, but it is important that those giving the feedback be identified, so that follow-up can be done. Anonymous feedback should not be considered or shared.
3. be shared in person with the chosen review team.

Use of Objective Tools

Any evaluation should include the use of tools that evaluate objective measurable information; (the number of new members received within the past year, changes in worship attendance or membership, the number of baptisms, confirmations).

Congregations have used a variety of forms to evaluate the performance of pastor and personnel. Some of these documents are used for the pastor or employee for the purpose of self evaluation, while others are prepared for a review that is performed by others.

Some churches formulate no more than four "SMART" objectives. These objectives may be defined as Specific, Measurable, Attainable, Realistic and Timely (or, as another defined Stretch, Measurable, Achievable, Results-oriented, and Timely). We include some sample questions gleaned for the responses we received.

8. What is currently frustrating about your work? What elements of your overall work assignment would you change, if you could?

9. What are you excited/passionate about regarding your work for the coming year?

10. In what areas do you need or want to make improvements over the next year?

11. What do you want to accomplish/eliminate/improve, in order to maximize your potential? What steps can you take to address these needs?

12. Is there any training you think you need to be more effective?

13. What are your major goals for the coming year?

14. How can we (staff supervisors/personnel committee) help you get this done? What can your supervisor or other members of the staff do to help you improve?

15. What barriers do you regularly encounter that prevent you from doing your best work? What suggestions do you have for minimizing or removing those barriers?

16. What changes in salary/compensation would you make, if that were delegated to you?

17. What ideas do you have to improve office conditions, relationships or operations?

18. Thinking of the past year, what significant accomplishments come to mind related to church office staff and Ministry?

19. Please note any additional items you believe should be addressed during your review.

20. Discuss or comment on any aspect of your job that you would like the personnel committee to be aware of, or problems that you would like help with.

(To be completed by supervisor)

1. What is this church doing in his/her work area that is helped this church flourish?

2. What else could she/he do in her/his work to be more helpful?

3. What would you like to see this person spend more time on?

4. What would you like to see this person spend less time on?

Use of Subjective Tools

Sessions will also necessarily deal with the subjective information when measuring the performance of their pastor/s. Some of the subjective expectations of the pastor can be measured by using the "Revised Skills List" prepared by the Church Leadership Connection that is used with the preparation of Church Information Form (CIF) and Personal Information Forms. (PIF) This skills list can be found through the website of the Presbyterian Church (USA).

We offer the following tool taken from the PC(USA) website for your consideration. The tool can be adapted to each job description by taking out questions that are not applicable (e.g. example you wouldn't have Rural Ministry category for an Urban church).

1. doesn't meet expectations
2. meets minimum expectations
3. meets expectations
4. exceeds expectations

Church Leadership Connection Revised Skills List With Definitions.

1 2 3 4 Administrative Leadership

Overseeing the delivery of planned activities or services. Encouraging and enabling volunteers and/or professional staff to accomplish their duties, achieve their goals, and develop their personal and professional gifts in response to God's call upon their lives. Evaluating the effectiveness of the programs.

1 2 3 4 Adult Ministry

Providing specialized knowledge of resources and programming that meets the needs of adults.

1 2 3 4 Budget Preparation

Working from a defined project or operational plan, developing an estimate of the financial resources required that enables the effective management of the project or operation with the constraints of the funds available.

1 2 3 4 Building Renovation/Property Development

Planning, budgeting, staffing, gaining acceptance for, and implementing significant renovation or real estate development projects.

1 2 3 4 Children's Ministry

Providing specialized knowledge of resources and programming which meets the needs of Children and their families.

1 2 3 4 Choir Directing

Planning and directing choirs and ensembles. (Adult, youth, children, handbell and praise band) with a sensitivity and concern for individuals and the church. Training choirs and ensembles and selecting appropriate music.

1 2 3 4 Communication (Written/Oral)

Expressing ideas, beliefs, and feelings in individual and group situations; adjusting language or terminology to intended audience and creating an enthusiastic response.

1 2 3 4 Community Ministries

Working directly with local community groups to establish programs responsive to local needs. Supporting a community or group by enabling the local leadership to emerge, flourish, and accomplish its own goals.

1 2 3 4 Community Service and Leadership

Leading in civic, interfaith activities related to issues impacting the community and the world.

1 2 3 4 Conflict Management/Mediation Skills

Negotiating or assisting in the constructive resolution of differences, bringing individuals, groups, or congregations together to identify interests, reframe issues, and work collaboratively seeking resolutions to differences.

1 2 3 4 Congregational Communication

Developing and monitoring the communication needs of the congregation and satisfying those information needs using a variety of media within appropriate budgetary and timing criteria.

1 2 3 4 Congregational Fellowship

Helping members and groups come together, know one another, have the opportunity to love and support one another, in response to God's call upon their lives.

1 2 3 4 Congregational Home Visitation

Planning for and participating in the visitation of members, prospective members, and members with special needs.

1 2 3 4 Congregational Redevelopment/Transformation

Working with the leadership, members and the community to transform the ministry of the congregation. Transformation is a redirection of the energies of the entire congregation to meet the new realities of the members and the community

1 2 3 4 Corporate Worship & Administration of Sacraments

Ordering worship and the administration of the sacraments in fresh and creative ways consistent with the Reformed Tradition.

1 2 3 4 Counseling

Helping both members and others to move toward spiritual maturity and increased comfort in a time of stress by listening, making appropriate responses, and, when needed, making referrals.

1 2 3 4 Cultural Proficiency/Cross-cultural Collaboration

Working across cultural and economic lines valuing all colleagues' views, and fostering joint decision making to solve problems by openly sharing information, building equity in team roles/relationships.

1 2 3 4 Curriculum Building

Developing a program of educational experiences that serves as the basis for the theological and biblical development of the members of the church/organization. The ability to adapt, plan and write curriculum for various age groups.

1 2 3 4 Defining Program Needs

Analyzing the educational or other programmatic needs of an organization or group of individuals.

1 2 3 4 Development of New Educational Experiences

Creating, evaluating, and refining new educational experiences based upon a needs analysis of the church/organization.

1 2 3 4 Ecumenical and Interfaith Activities

Working with other religious groups and their leaders to accomplish a common goal that fosters mutual understanding.

1 2 3 4 Evaluation of Program and Staff

Assessing specific programs and/or staff; encouraging and facilitating an environment of accountability, recognition, openness, and constructive feedback.

1 2 3 4 Evangelism

Leading persons to share faith in Christ as a personal savior and encouraging their identification with, and participation in the church and community.

1 2 3 4 Facility Management

Organizing and overseeing the maintenance of a physical property or building.

1 2 3 4 Family Ministry

Providing specialized knowledge of resources and programming that meets the needs of families.

1 2 3 4 Financial Management

Guiding and monitoring the investment, expenditure, or allocation of church or organization funds so the group's financial objectives are achieved.

1 2 3 4 Fund-Raising

Developing methods and programs to finance the work of a church or organization through donations and contributions from individuals and organizations.

1 2 3 4 Governing Body Ministry

Working with presbytery, synod and general assembly committees in shaping and implementing their ministries.

1 2 3 4 Group Process Facilitation

Guiding the process in a way that enables a group to define their goals, needs, concerns, etc., and to combine their gifts to achieve the desired needs.

1 2 3 4 Hospital and Emergency Visitation

Visiting persons in crisis to offer spiritual support and pastoral presence.

1 2 3 4 Information Technology

Utilizing modern computer and telecommunications facilities, programs, and resources to accomplish functions on a cost-effective basis.

1 2 3 4 Instrumental Music

Ability to play a variety of musical instruments for worship services, (e.g. organ, piano, guitar, woodwind, horn, other).

1 2 3 4 Involvement in Mission beyond the Local Community

Identifying specific projects or programs that enable persons and/or groups to support, study, and participate in the church's worldwide mission.

1 2 3 4 Leadership Development

Recognizing and calling forth potential of persons as leaders of the Church's ministry and providing opportunities for their training, development, and growth.

1 2 3 4 Leadership of Staff/Volunteers

Working with staff and volunteers to develop a vision for the church's/organization's future by creating a climate of involvement and enthusiasm.

1 2 3 4 Leading Music Ministry

Providing leadership for the church's music program with a sensitivity and concern for individuals and the church. Participating in worship planning with staff. A demonstrated knowledge of the theology and practice of Presbyterian worship and the music appropriate to enhance this tradition.

1 2 3 4 Legal/Tax Matters

Knowledge of and experience with current civil law and IRS regulations as they apply to church/non-profit context.

1 2 3 4 Management of Building Usage

Overseeing the scheduling and application of building resources to meet the needs of users. Developing plans for expansion, remodeling, or additional furnishings if needed.

1 2 3 4 Management of Equipment Resources

Defining needs, purchasing, and overseeing the use and maintenance of equipment.

1 2 3 4 New Church Development

Working with the presbytery and others to develop a new and viable church that fosters a people of faith who minister to the community and world.

1 2 3 4 Office Management

Overseeing the ongoing work of an office staff to meet schedules, budgets, and to ensue efficient operations.

1 2 3 4 Older Adult Ministry Providing specialized knowledge of resources and programming that meets the needs of older adults.1 2 3 4 Organization/Administration

Ability to manage data, events, projects with appropriate attention to detail and meet deadlines.

1 2 3 4 Organizational Leadership and Development

Identifying strengths and weaknesses in an organization's structure, culture, processes, capabilities. Developing a strategic plan to increase effectiveness. Working with staff or volunteers to implement systems that result in improvements in quality, timeliness, or efficiency of operations.

1 2 3 4 PCUSA Polity/Constitutional Knowledge

Understanding and appreciating Presbyterian Form of Government. Experience in applying to congregational and middle governing body contexts.

1 2 3 4 Parliamentary Expertise

Understanding and appreciating parliamentary procedures, and Roberts Rules of Order. Experience in applying to congregational and middle governing body contexts.

1 2 3 4 Pastoral Care

Providing support to members and constituents as they wrestle with the events of their lives.

1 2 3 4 Preaching

Interpreting the biblical text to the contemporary situation; bringing it to bear in the congregation's life and work.

1 2 3 4 Problem Solving/Decision Making

Systematically breaking down problems or opportunities into components by identifying relevant issues, fact-finding, and recognizing connections. Generating options, evaluating them and selecting the "best" one for implementation.

1 2 3 4 Project Management

Developing a workable plan for accomplishing a specific objective. Monitoring and facilitating progress in implementing the plan. Modifying the project objectives and resource needs as the plan unfolds.

1 2 3 4 Rural Ministry

Providing pastoral leadership to congregations located in isolated or sparsely populated areas. Appreciation for the natural environment and rural life, ability to cope with isolation, willingness to travel significant distances, relational leadership style, strong people skills.

1 2 3 4 Scholarship/Publishing

Writing and publishing in one's field of expertise for the church and the academy. Participating in guild meetings and activities. Setting standards of academic excellence.

1 2 3 4 Small Membership Church

Providing pastoral leadership to congregations with fewer than 100 active participants. Demonstrates relational leadership style, flexibility, strong people skills. Enjoys visitation and fellowship opportunities.

1 2 3 4 Spiritual Development

Providing personal spiritual care, resources, guidance, and leadership for persons seeking to deepen their faith in Jesus Christ.

1 2 3 4 Staffing/Human Resources

Identifying the skills, knowledge, and attitudes needed to accomplish the functions of a church/organization and acting to identify and recruit persons for particular positions.

1 2 3 4 Stewardship and Commitment Programs

Challenging members to develop a lifestyle that demonstrates responsible stewardship and motivating them to work and contribute their resources to the work of the Church.

1 2 3 4 Strategic Planning

Working with the Session or organization to develop directional goals and activities that shape the future and relate to the church's/organization's fundamental decisions.

1 2 3 4 Teaching

Providing instruction and/or educational experiences that increase theological and biblical awareness, skill and motivation to continue learning.

1 2 3 4 Training Volunteers

Delivering specialized training that suits the skills and knowledge needs, constraints, and sensitivities of non-paid workers in the church/organization.

1 2 3 4 Transitional/Interim Leadership

Has special training and skills to assist church organizations or governing bodies in developmental and process tasks during the time between leaders.

1 2 3 4 Urban Ministry

Providing pastoral leadership to congregations located within urban/inner city areas. Skills include community assessment skills, understanding congregations as systems, community organizing and development skills, accessing resources, and sensitivity to cross-cultural environments.

1 2 3 4 Youth Ministry

Providing specialized knowledge of resources and programming which meets the needs of youth and their families.

1 2 3 4 Young Adult Ministry

Providing specialized knowledge of resources and programming that meets the needs of young adults.